

**Belleten, Cilt: LXXVIII, Sayı 282, Ağustos 2014, Türk Tarih Kurumu,
Ankara, s. 816-823. ISSN: 0041-4255**

T. Mikail P. DUGGAN*

The Turkish Historical Association was established by the founder of the Turkish Republic, Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, and, under the auspices of the T. C. Başkanlığı Atatürk Kültür, Dil ve Tarih Yüksek Kurumu, The Turkish Republic Presidential Atatürk Culture, Language and History, High Association, the Turkish Historical Society-Türk Tarih Kurumu, since 1937 has published the academic periodical entitled Belleten.

Belleten is a quarterly publication that is frequently cited in academic works and is regarded, both within and beyond the borders of Turkey, as being a flagship of Turkish academic scholarship in the fields of art history, archaeology, ancient languages and history. In addition to an article by Mustafa Kemal Atatürk which was published in 1938, the TTK has published peer-reviewed original and important articles by both Turkish and non-Turkish scholars such as: İbrahim Artuk, Wilhelm Barthold, Kurt Bittel, Helmuth Th. Bossert, Semavi Eyice, Halil İnalcık, Füruzan Kinal, M. Fuad Köprülü, Arif Müfid Mansel, İlber Ortaylı, Semra Ögel, Gönül Öney, Tahsin Özgür, İsmail Hakkı Uzunçarşılı, Muzaffer Süleyman Şenyürek, A. Süheyl Ünver, Osman Turan and Paul Wittek, amongst many other scholars who have contributed to their fields of learning through articles and reviews-notices that have been published in this periodical over the course of the past 77 years. In consequence, it is a publication with a most considerable reputation to uphold.

The publishing requirements for an article to be published in Belleten include the supply by each author of an article, of an abstract of the article's contents, in both Turkish and English, each abstract not to exceed 200 words, together with the key words for the article, while the editorial board of Belleten reserves the right to, "*make minor editing changes and corrections*". Any person unfamiliar with the Turkish language, but wishing to understand something of the scholarly articles that are contained in the August 2014 issue of Belleten would turn to pages 816-823 where the English abstracts of the articles in this issue are printed.

The importance of an abstract for an article is clear, it is the summary in 200 words of the contents of an article that may consist of 30 pages of text, and so, it provides the widow into the article for the reader, if the window is clean, the reader can see clearly if the article is of interest, if, however, the abstract presents a somewhat unclear pane, the article, however good, will have fewer readers willing to bother to read and/or translate it. The importance of an abstract has further increased since these abstracts via key words are today more widely accessible through being published on the internet. The following are two examples of abstracts from the August 2014 issue of Belleten.

The English abstract of the scholarly article by Ali Özcan: Gâvurkale Hittite Rock Reliefs,

* Lecturer, Art Historian, Akdeniz University, Mediterranean Civilisations Research Institute, Antalya, tmpduggan@yahoo.com

(815), is not only 50 words longer than the, “*not exceeding 200 words*” specified in the publication requirements for the length of the abstract, (The abstract entitled, Nuh Arslantaş: Institutions of Jewish Basic Education in the Abbasid Period: Beth Hassephers And (sic) Beth Hamidrashs, (816-7) is by far the longest in this issue, 346 words, exceeding the limit by 146 words, and contains the fine typo, “*excile*”) but this abstract reads as follows:

“Location called Gâvurkale, is at a distance of about 60 km. southwest of Ankara, at a site which is closer to Haymana, in a place between Ankara-Haymana and is on about 2 km northwest of Dereköy. The hill rising at the side of Babayakup creek having an approximate height of 60 meters has a dominant place over the valley. It has an elevation of 1180 meters from the sea level. In peak part of the hill, there are remnants of city wall which were made by using kiklopic stones and at the direction of the hill facing South, there is a figure of god/ goddess subjected to destruction understood to be seated on the chair of throne and figure of two men described in walking position who are staying on the surface of the smoothed main rock. Stylistic characteristics of figures are reflecting the Hittite style. Furthermore, at the peak section of the hill, there is remnants of a room made by using kiklopic Stones by placing them one over another to form a structure. The function of the subject room formed a topic for discussions until recent times. There is no traces of written finding faced with at Gâvurkale .

Efforts are made in this study, to arrive at conclusions by examining the rock reliefs present at Gâvurkale, under the light of Hittite texts of cuneiform writing and the archaeological findings. Furthermore, the function of the room facing North of the hill will be made subject of assessments by taking into consideration Hittite texts of cuneiform writing”.

Your eye may be caught by the use of the word “*kiklopic*,” neither Luwian nor Nesite, but a phonetic rendition of the word cyclopean into Turkish - in this English abstract, the word, “*kiklopic*” slipping past editors and proof readers alike. The sentence, “*In peak part of the hill, there are remnants of city wall which were made by using kiklopic stones and at the direction of the hill facing South, there is a figure of god/ goddess subjected to destruction understood to be seated on the chair of throne and figure of two men described in walking position who are staying on the surface of the smoothed main rock*”, required some editing to prevent possible misunderstanding and/or amusement. The following is an edited version of the abstract of Ali Özcan’s article, “Gâvurkale Hittite Rock Reliefs” It is a 199 word abstract.

“About 60 km. Southwest of Ankara, closer to Haymana and about 2 km. Northwest of Dereköy is Gâvurkale. Located on a hilltop rising approximately 60 meters from the side of Babayakup Creek, in a commanding position overlooking the valley, Gâvurkale is at an elevation of 1180 meters A.S.L. Below the summit of the hill are the remains of the city wall constructed of cyclopean masonry and, facing towards the South, on the surface of the smoothed main rock there is the damaged relief carving of a god or goddess, thought to be seated on a throne and the relief depicting two men walking. These figures are Hittite in style. In addition, on the summit of the hill are the remains of a room with walls of cyclopean masonry. The function of this room formed a topic of recent discussion. There are no finds of inscriptions or traces thereof from Gâvurkale.

This article presents its conclusions through the study of the rock reliefs at Gâvurkale, within the context of the related Hittite cuneiform texts and archaeological finds. Further, the function of the room facing North on the hill is considered within the context of the relevant Hittite cuneiform texts”.

The English abstract of Murat Yıldız's scholarly article (819) entitled: "The Sultan of the Ottoman Khass Bagchas (the private garden of the Sultan's palace): The Khass Bagcha of Sultaniyya" of 144 words is unfortunately noteworthy for the following: "...between Paşabahçe ile Beykoz was indebted...", where the Turkish word *ile* stands incongruously, there should rather be the English word, *and*. In the sentence which reads, "*In where was organised activities like hunting, jeered, wooden ball, wrestling, marksmanship, musicale and banquet*", there are a number of unfortunate oddities. The word *jeered*, is more usually spelt, *jerid*, thereby precluding any confusion with the past tense of the word, *jeer*, Tr. *Yuha*; while *musicale* is a 19th c. Anglicisation - Americanism from the French, an abbreviation of, *soirée musicale*, a word which is unknown to modern Turkish, the reply when consulting the TDK (Turkish Language Society) is, "*musicale sözü bulunamadı*", i.e., word not found. *Musicale* is not to be found in the Redhouse Ottoman Dictionary of 1890, nor in its New Edition of 1983, although the words, *musiki* and *musikişinas*, of Arabic and Persian origin respectively are recorded. It occurs in the Shorter Oxford Dictionary³ of 1969, but is not in common usage. So why is this Anglicised 19th century version of the French employed in this abstract, rather than simply, musical parties? While the activity, if it be such, "*wooden ball*," seems to be otherwise unknown as an activity and has no meaning in English, except in its literal sense; while the word "*banquet*", should rather read, "*banqueting*", in the plural. The English sentence could therefore read, "*In this park were organised activities such as: hunting, jerid, wooden ball (?)*, *wrestling, marksmanship contests, musical parties and banqueting*". The key words for this article include, "*bagcha*", which is repeated three times, a word which when spelt in this fashion seems to be entirely unknown to the Turkish, Osmanlica or English language dictionaries. The word that should have been employed as a key word for this article is either: *garden*, *bâğçe* or *bahçe*. Unfortunately the phonetic form transcribed into Latin letters of the Persian word for a small garden, *bâğçe*, has been employed as a key word and using the phonetic form of the word in any internet search is a somewhat less than usual practice.

It does not require a genius in these days of word processing to run an abstract or an article through a spelling and language checker, to remove simple errors, such as the absence of a space between a full stop and a capital letter or the absence of a space between one word and another, incorrect capitalisation, etc.; while to cast an educated editorial eye over a text before it goes to press is surely to be expected from a longstanding scholarly publication with a reputation such as Belleten possesses. It is important that this work is done thoroughly, as copy editing preserves both the scholar and the publication from being perceived as following some sort of post-modern or humorous, rather than a scholarly agenda.